Enhancing graduate prospects by recording and reflecting upon part-time work:

A challenge to students and universities

Authors Details

Carl Evans (will receive correspondence)
Senior Lecturer
University of West of England (UWE)
Coldharbour Lane
Bristol
BS16 1QY
Carl.Evans@uwe.ac.uk

Mark Richardson
Deputy Pro Vice Chancellor (Academic Portfolio) and Head of Business School
University of Worcester
Castle Street
Worcester
WR1 3AS
m.richardson@worc.ac.uk
Enhancing graduate prospects by recording and reflecting upon part-time work:

A challenge to students and universities

Abstract

Business leaders are becoming increasingly explicit regarding the skills, attributes and behaviours expected of graduate entrants. These skills are often developed through a combination of academic studies and work experience. While universities are increasingly providing opportunities for experiential learning, typically a placement year or internship, a growing number of students are undertaking self-initiated part-time work alongside their full-time degree studies. This part-time employment, typically in retail or hospitality, will help develop the skills, attributes and behaviours that employers demand. However, it is important that graduates are able to elucidate their learning to future employers during the graduate recruitment process. The purpose of this viewpoint article is to challenge full-time degree students who are working part-time to record (perhaps through a logbook) and reflect on their work experience and thus be able to provide concrete examples to reinforce their skills and experience. The article concludes by discussing the role of universities in the process.

Keywords: Part-time working, graduate careers, personal portfolio, reflective practice

Paper Type: Viewpoint piece
The Needs of Employers

The Graduate Market Report (High Fliers, 2016) highlights that employers are seeking graduates who can effectively demonstrate a broad-range of work-related knowledge, skills and behaviours. As a consequence, business organisations tend to look favourably on individuals who have developed these skills during periods of work-experience and, more importantly, how these skills might be effectively utilised in a full-time graduate position (Evans et al., 2015, Heaton et al., 2008; McMurray, 2016). In addition, the BIS Research Paper No. 231 (IES/HECSU, 2015, p. 86) finds that even employers who do not explicitly demand prior work experience for graduate posts, believe that graduates who have some form of work experience perform better throughout the recruitment and selection process.

The context of higher education in the UK has been transformed in recent years due to the evolution of government policy, employer needs and student demands. For example, following the 2006 Leitch Report, which challenged UK higher education providers to develop industry-ready graduates, universities have acknowledged that a degree alone is insufficient to support graduates into appropriate employment (Wilton, 2011; York, 2004). Similarly, prompted by The Dearing Report (1997), which recommended degree students should be able to undertake a period of work practice as part of the learning experience, universities have increasingly sought to provide students with a broad range of experiential learning opportunities, such as work placements (Burke et al., 2009), internships and work-based projects. The work by Artess et al. (2017) confirms that universities have responded to these challenges and that a substantial amount of academic endeavour has been devoted to enhancing graduate employability.

The recent emergence of degree apprenticeships, such as the Chartered Manager Degree Apprenticeship (CMDA), where full-time employment facilitates the embedding of substantial components of work-based learning within a part-time degree course, is an example of this shift in educational provision. While it is still relatively early in the life-cycle to determine the popularity of degree apprenticeships, indications to date show more than 27,000 higher and degree apprenticeships commenced in 2015-16, with an additional £4.5m allocated by government to support the commencement of further programmes in 2017-18 (Department for Education, 2016).
Placements allow individuals to enhance their employability by developing skills, such as team working and problem-solving (Jackson, 2013a; 2013b). In addition, some authors contend that placements have a positive impact on subsequent academic performance (Crawford and Wang, 2015; 2016). Nonetheless, it has been argued that the value of placements derived by individuals is inconsistent and subject to a number of variables (Wilton, 2012), such as the academic ability (Bullock et al., 2009) and career orientation (Arnold et al., 1993) of the student. Yet, the development of employer-demanded skills (Paisley and Paisley, 2010) through a work placement, has been seen to significantly improve graduate employment prospects, post-graduation (Brooks, 2012; Brooks and Youngson, 2016).

Despite the positive outcomes derived from work placements, they are still perceived by many students and higher education institutions (HEIs) to be an additional activity experienced alongside the degree, rather than an embedded feature of academic study (Harvey, 2005; Knight and Yorke, 2002). While there are calls for greater collaboration between universities and employers to ensure graduates are prepared for graduate level employment (Ishengoma and Vaaland, 2015; Rosenberg, 2015), some employers find it difficult to provide meaningful work experience for students (Jackson et al., 2016). Indeed, while 89% of employers believe that embedding work experience within courses would make graduates more employable, only 22% offer formal opportunities for students to gain work experience (21st Century Leaders Report, 2014).

**Students’ part-time work activities**

As universities and employers wrestle to determine an appropriate approach to providing valuable work experience, increasing numbers of full-time students undertake self-initiated, part-time work concurrent with their studies (Boyce and Stone, 2015; UCAS, 2011) primarily driven by financial necessity (Crockford et al., 2015; Richardson et al., 2009). A cursory review of positions typically filled by students, such as retail assistant, checkout assistant and waiter/waitress, on a jobs website (see, for example, indeed.co.uk), will reveal a person specification requiring essential attributes such as, ‘Good communicator’, ‘Team-oriented’, ‘Passionate about customer service’, ‘Work-well under pressure’ and ‘Friendly and
professional’. Unsurprisingly, these are amongst the attributes and skills that are demanded by employers seeking full-time graduates. This is confirmed by Targetjobs (2016), who advise graduates not to overlook the skills gathered from part-time work, including ‘commercial awareness’, ‘time management’ and ‘cultural awareness’.

Many students are therefore undertaking work activities that support the development of a range of transferable skills and attributes that are sought after by employers, such as team-working, customer-interaction and communication (Wilton, 2008). Yet, when it comes to elucidating those skills to prospective employers in either graduate job applications or at interview, students often do not make the most of skills, capabilities or experience they have gained during their part-time work, giving too great an emphasis to their academic studies (Evans et al., 2015). This is confirmed by the BIS Research Paper No. 231 (IES/HECSU, 2015, p. 217) which states that one of the key failings of graduates is a frequent inability to demonstrate their skills to best effect. It seems therefore, that students are failing to recognise, and fully embrace, the skills derived from their part-time jobs in order to enhance their attractiveness to prospective employers upon graduation (Aggett and Busby, 2011; Evans et al., 2014). Students need to have better appreciation of the skills that they have developed through their part-time work, and be able to describe to prospective employers how these might apply to a particular graduate position.

One challenge for the student is how to record their key work experiences, especially if they have had a portfolio of part-time jobs over the three years of their degree. What might help this process is a means to record key experiences in order to serve as a reminder of activities undertaken, reflect on their learning, and project that learning into the desired graduate role.

**The challenge to students**

There is therefore, an opportunity for students to take a more strategic and long-term perspective to their part-time work, look beyond the immediate financial gratification and utilise the experience that part-time work provides, in order to construct a more robust and employer-oriented self-proposition. This implies that a method of recording experiential learning derived from part-time work might be helpful to students in order to allow them to
reflect upon that experience, consider how to optimise its value throughout the selection process, and potentially inform their chosen career path, prior to starting their graduate job search. Reflection facilitates a more insightful understanding of situations encountered and embeds skills that could be utilised in future work situations (Rogers, 2001).

This may require the students to engage in activities such as completing a logbook, or similar, in order to record and reflect on work experiences. There is compelling evidence that reflective journals can contribute to improved academic performance (Al-Rawahi and Al-Balushi, 2015; Chang and Lin, 2014), facilitate deeper learning (Coulson and Harvey, 2013) and also be useful in supporting ongoing professional development (Boud, 2001; Moon, 2006). Reflective journals not only allow students to make the link between practice and theoretical perspectives (Ashley et al., 2006), but also connect the learning with other elements of the course (Manns, 2003), which may include some form of experiential learning. Additionally, Morris-Day (2013) finds that reflection can lead to an improvement in work-based practice, something which might enhance employability credentials for graduates.

Moreover, McHann and Frost (2010) emphasise how learning journals can facilitate student transition from study to the workplace through the process of ‘learning-by-doing’. This approach provides an opportunity to record work activities in the journal and to frame problems and issues arising from that experience (Cooper and Dunlap, 1989) or key events (Boud, 2001). These events, or critical incidents, may be useful to draw upon at subsequent graduate job interviews where employers typically seek evidence of challenges encountered and how they were effectively dealt with, and also how these specific examples reconcile to the employer’s behavioural competencies. It is therefore not merely a process of recording a log of experiences, but a vehicle to support reflection (Hubbs and Brand, 2010).

Additionally, Rich (2015) finds that journals provide an opportunity to create a vision of the future, which in this instance, provides a connection between part-time work activity and future graduate employment.

Nonetheless, while the benefit of reflection is to allow a connection between theory and practice, Smith et al. (2007) find that reflection is especially difficult in social sciences subjects since it is not an embedded discipline, and therefore students generally struggle without substantial support from their tutors. Holden and Griggs (2011) highlight the
difficulties in transferring reflective practice from the classroom to other scenarios. In addition, there could be reluctance for students to engage with what seems like an academic activity, especially if it does not contribute directly to their degree classification – students are typically outcomes-oriented (Kerawalla et al., 2008). Typically, students struggle with effective journaling, needing support for the process (Kheng and June, 2015; Shamim, 2012). Here, Brett et al. (2009) advocate the use of a framework which helps those who are new to journaling, or where the process is devoid of an assessment brief and specified learning outcomes. Additionally, experience could be structured around employability skills (see: https://www.skillsyouneed.com/general/graduate-employability-skills.html), or for those targeting managerial positions in organisations, the management and leadership standards (http://www.management-standards.org/standards/standards).

Moreover, the use of technology with which students are familiar, such as an e-journal (or blogging), might encourage students to participate in the process (Ferguson et al., 2016; Muncy, 2014). Blogging allows students to not only present commentary to a wide audience, but to share knowledge, participate in a community-network and thereby increase learning (Alterman and Larusson, 2013; Kuo, 2016). While some students might be reluctant to share their part-time work experiences in a classroom, Jaidev (2014) found that many are more comfortable in sharing their experiences through blogging. Moreover, Stoker (2015) found that the process of blogging can support the development of work-related skills, which in turn could improve employability prospects.

The challenge for universities

The intention here is not for students’ part-time work to be accredited as part of the degree programme, but for students to utilise the part-time work that they undertake while on their degree, in order to perform more effectively throughout the graduate recruitment process. Nonetheless, it is recognised that in order to encourage students to fully engage with the process of recording and reflecting on part-time work activities, and for university staff to fully support the process, there may be a need to formally embed and assess it within the degree course. To this end, models of accrediting work-based and work-related learning are now commonplace across the university sector (Gibbs and Morris, 2001). While minimal levels of part-time working are not detrimental to academic performance (McVicar and McKee, 2002; Salamonson and Andrew, 2006), university staff may be reluctant to
engage with supporting students in the process of recording and reflecting on their part-time work experiences, especially where students can struggle adjusting to academic life (Broadbridge and Swanson, 2005), or because it adds to the administrative burden of tutors. Nonetheless, one of the key criteria of the new Teaching Excellence Framework (TEF) (see: http://www.hefce.ac.uk/lt/tef/) is to raise levels of graduate employability, and therefore activities that raise this key measure will be increasingly important to universities. Moreover, students’ reflective journals may inform universities regarding the integration of experience gained through part-time work, which in turn might help shape the curriculum and approaches to skills development in future provision.

**Conclusion**

There is much written about the knowledge and skills that employers demand from their graduates (see, for example 21st Century Leaders Report, 2014). There is an increasing, and understandable, requirement for transferable skills to be developed by individuals as an integrated part of their degree studies, whether through a conventional undergraduate degree course or a degree apprenticeship.

This new higher education landscape requires HEIs to reflect on the value proposition that they offer to prospective students – the quality of the student experience and the graduate prospects that studying a particular degree course will impart. At the same time, prospective students will need to reflect on which route is best suited to their individual circumstances, learning style and long-term aspirations.

Formal work experience, such as the one year ‘sandwich’ placement, is well established across a number of courses and a number of universities (Ward and Jeffries, 2004). Nonetheless, for those students who cannot, or do not, take advantage of a formal placement, embracing a reflective approach to their part-time working will help to ‘blur the boundary’ between work and study – with learning achieved in both contexts. In doing so, this might raise the employability rate of graduates and boost economic productivity. If the approach proposed here is to be facilitated, it will require universities to stop viewing students’ part-time work as a hindrance to their studies, but an activity that should be encouraged and supported.
This might be achieved through integrating accredited part-time work-based learning within the degree course. University and course teams might also facilitate unaccredited part-time working, enabling students to ‘earn as they learn’ through an extension to the remit of the careers service. Critical decisions for the course teams include the extent to which experiential learning opportunities are accredited and the level of compulsion to opt into such activities. Creation of explicit links between part-time working and the core curriculum might also be explored, particularly if course teams are able to develop links with local organisations which reflect the academic discipline. For example, might a BA (Hons) History course team develop links with local museums to give undergraduate students (paid or unpaid) experience which might be assessed as part of the course or the broader skills development agenda? This will have implications for staff in terms of role, workload and increased administrative burden as they seek to secure and manage a broad range of external relationships, which may be resisted. However, the potential benefits for the students, the partner organisations and the course team are profound and should therefore be explored.

References


Boyce, L. and Stone, L. (2015) Eight in ten students now forced to work to fund university as expected debt spirals to £30,000 for those starting studies this year [online]. London: This is Money. [Accessed 1st April 2016]. Available at: <http://www.thisismoney.co.uk/money/studentfinance/article-3196644/Eight-ten-students-forced-work-fund-university-expected-debt-spirals-30-000-starting-studies-year.html>.


